



Review article

An assessment of heterotrophy and mixotrophy in *Scenedesmus* and its utilization in wastewater treatment

Joseph Msanne^{a,b,*}, Juergen Polle^{c,d}, Shawn Starckenburg^b

^a New Mexico Consortium, Los Alamos, NM 87544, United States of America

^b Bioscience Division, Los Alamos National Laboratory, Los Alamos, NM 87544, United States of America

^c Department of Biology, Brooklyn College of the City University of New York, Brooklyn, NY 11210, United States of America

^d The Graduate Center of the City University of New York, New York, NY 10016, United States of America



ARTICLE INFO

Keywords:

Wastewater
Scenedesmus
 Mixotrophy
 Heterotrophy
 Central carbon metabolism

ABSTRACT

Wastewater contains various macro and micronutrients essential for growth. Microalgae-based wastewater treatment offers an alternative process that couples nutrient uptake and the value-added production of a biofuels feedstock or other algal-derived products. In this review, we summarize previous efforts to cultivate the microalgae *Scenedesmus* sp. in different wastewater sources, and report on the effectiveness of nutrient and organic substrate removal, CO₂ mitigation, and resulting biomass productivities. As biomass productivity is a function of growth, we also investigated the extent of functional genomics resources that are available to study the regulation of central carbon metabolism in *Scenedesmus*.

1. Introduction

Population growth as well as industrialization and urbanization increase the production of wastewater, leading to water toxicity and eutrophication when released into aquatic ecosystems. Using microalgae for the removal of nutrients and other contaminants from wastewater (particularly secondary and tertiary wastewater effluent) in phototrophic systems decreases the risks of eutrophication, and simultaneously fixes CO₂ through photosynthesis, effectively reducing greenhouse gas (GHG) emissions [1–9]. Given that monosaccharides and other organic compounds are prevalent in many wastewater sources [10–13], microalgal growth in these waste streams may be considered mixotrophic, since they can utilize inorganic CO₂ for photosynthesis and organic carbon compounds for other metabolic pathways. Previously, microalgae have been cultivated mixotrophically in these waste streams [5,14–20]. Post-utilization in wastewater treatment applications, cells can be harvested for their lipid content (formed as byproducts of this procedure [15,16,21–23]), and extracted and converted into fatty acid methyl esters (FAMEs) by transesterification for use as biofuel. Depending on the water source, the remaining high-protein algal biomass may be used as feed supplements for the livestock and aquaculture industries [24,70]. A second cultivation scheme for microalgae is a heterotrophic system (closed system without light), which may result in increased cell density, modulated cell composition, and increased biomass productivity compared to phototrophic

cultivation [11,25,26]. Examples are the green algae *Auxenochlorella protothecoides* and *Chromochloris zofingiensis*, which can shift their metabolism to grow under heterotrophic conditions [27,28].

Although microalgal growth and mineral nutrient removal from wastewater have been previously examined [29–32], the nature and level of organic carbon content in wastewater, as well as the uptake and utilization of these substrates by microalgae is not well understood. One microalgal freshwater genus that has been used in both biofuel and wastewater treatment research is *Scenedesmus*. Compared to other oleaginous microalgae, *Scenedesmus* species currently represent some of the best candidates for the production of biofuels and biomaterials [33,34]. *Scenedesmus* sp. lipid content ranges from about 10% to 50% of dry biomass weight, depending on the species and growth conditions [23,33,86,93]. Moreover, *Scenedesmus* sp. have gained interest as a source for various secondary metabolites, particularly carotenoids (e.g. α-carotene, β-carotene, lutein, etc.), since many species are capable of enhanced pigment production while simultaneously treating different types of wastewater [93,132–134]. *Scenedesmus* sp. have also been shown to assimilate glucose by heterotrophic or mixotrophic growth [35–37]. Additionally, *Scenedesmus* can effectively grow in a wide temperature range, a property beneficial for outdoor raceway cultivation [38]. They can efficiently fix CO₂ [8], while showing high tolerance to industrial flue gas [37,39].

So far, strain development for wastewater treatment or to maximize productivity of *Scenedesmus* (and other microalgae as well) in biofuel

* Corresponding author at: New Mexico Consortium, Los Alamos, NM 87544, United States of America.

E-mail address: jmsanne@newmexicoconsortium.org (J. Msanne).

Table 1

Elemental composition of different wastewaters reviewed here. Not available (N/A) means values were not reported in the research paper.

	Municipal secondary effluent [4]	Municipal wastewater [70]	Poultry wastewater (Flocculated) [71]	Food wastewater [37]	Brewery wastewater [73]	Dairy wastewater [5]	Urban wastewater centrate [7]
Total nitrogen (TN)	11–14 mg L ⁻¹	52.6 mg L ⁻¹	N/A	725 mg L ⁻¹	150 mg L ⁻¹	86 mg L ⁻¹	N/A
N-NH ₄ ⁺	N/A	52.2 mg L ⁻¹	259.3 mg L ⁻¹	N/A	N/A	N/A	628 mg L ⁻¹
N-NO ₃ ⁻	N/A	0.4 mg L ⁻¹	Not Detected	N/A	N/A	31 mg L ⁻¹	7.2 mg L ⁻¹
Total phosphorus (TP)	1–1.5 mg L ⁻¹	N/A	N/A	62.5 mg L ⁻¹	220 mg L ⁻¹	N/A	N/A
P-PO ₄ ³⁻	N/A	8.47 mg L ⁻¹	23.4 mg L ⁻¹	N/A	N/A	8.7 mg L ⁻¹	64 mg L ⁻¹
Total sulfur (TS)	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	2200 mg L ⁻¹	13 mg L ⁻¹	N/A
Total suspended solids (TSS)	N/A	540 mg L ⁻¹	100 mg L ⁻¹	N/A	N/A	3830 mg L ⁻¹	0.12 mg L ⁻¹
Total solids (TS)	N/A	N/A	700 mg L ⁻¹	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A
Total organic carbon (TOC)	18–22 mg L ⁻¹	N/A	N/A	10,173 mg L ⁻¹	N/A	170 mg L ⁻¹	182 mg L ⁻¹
Maltose	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	860 mg L ⁻¹	N/A	N/A
Chemical oxygen demand (COD)	N/A	400 mg L ⁻¹	97 mg O ₂ L ⁻¹	N/A	N/A	655 mg L ⁻¹	N/A
CO ₂ concentrations	0.03–15%	N/A	N/A	5–14%	N/A	N/A	10%
pH	7.5	6.9	N/A	6	N/A	6.5	7.8
Salinity	N/A	0.4 mg L ⁻¹	N/A	3.7%	N/A	N/A	N/A
Malt extract	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	1000 mg L ⁻¹	N/A	N/A
Yeast extract	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	500 mg L ⁻¹	N/A	N/A
Ethanol	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	2 mL L ⁻¹	N/A	N/A

cultivation systems have been limited due to the lack of genomic information, knowledge of genetic regulation, or effective genome manipulation tools. Given that core metabolic pathways and algal genetic systems are highly variable across and within algal classes, knowledge gained from well-studied chlorophytes (i.e. *Chlamydomonas* and *Chlorella*) is not always applicable. Herein, we report on the state of knowledge regarding the utilization of *Scenedesmus* sp. in the treatment of wastewater and the impact of this cultivation method on biomass and lipid production for fuel conversion. We also review the heterotrophic/mixotrophic cultivation techniques of *Scenedesmus* microalgae by manipulation of carbon/nitrogen sources in the growth medium, aimed at increasing biomass productivity. Finally, given the availability of reduced organic molecules in various wastewaters and their potential to improve microalgal biomass productivity, we additionally review what is known about carbon metabolism in this industrially-relevant lineage.

2. Cultivation and remediation schemes

Given that wastewater can be sourced from domestic, municipal, chemical, and/or agro-industrial processes, the characteristics of these effluents can vary compositionally and temporally [16,44,45]. Nonetheless, wastewater effluents rich in inorganic nutrients can support microalgae growth. These effluents have been shown to support cultivation of microalgae in: 1) closed photobioreactors (PBRs) [46–48], 2) shallow, paddlewheel-mixed, open raceway ponds often called high-rate ponds (HRPs), and 3) revolving attached biofilm (RAB) systems [130,131]. Both HRPs and RABs have been utilized for final tertiary treatment prior to the discharge of effluents into aquatic ecosystems [16,45,49–57], while PBRs have been envisioned to produce high-value food supplements and pigments [46–48]. Each cultivation system has advantages and disadvantages. Suspended microalgae cultivation in PBRs or HRPs is energy-intensive due to the movement of large amounts of water. HRPs are the least expensive to operate but prone to contamination with undesired organisms, and are marked by low biomass productivity relative to PBRs and RAB systems. In addition to effective nutrients removal and wastewater treatment, RAB systems can enhance CO₂ mass transfer, resulting in significant increases in areal biomass production rates.

Many groups have been working to optimize nutrient removal and cultivation processes of the aforementioned systems. Nutrient use/removal efficiency has been enhanced in all systems by CO₂ addition [50,58,59]. For example, bubbling CO₂-rich flue gas into ponds or PBRs

doubled algal biomass productivity to 16–20 g m⁻² d⁻¹ [15,58,60–64]. When cultivating in wastewater that is rich in dissolved organic matter, aerobic bacterial decomposition can increase carbon availability and boost algal biomass productivity [15,58]. With respect to harvesting/dewatering, algae can be collected from RAB systems more economically than from PBRs and HRPs [130,131]. To reduce dewatering costs of PBRs and HRPs, strain choice alone can simplify harvesting as *Scenedesmus* sp. and a few other colonial microalgae can settle by gravity. Furthermore, others have tested bioflocculation schemes to improve settling after the nutrients in media become limited [16,48,58,60,61,65–67]. In summary, some cost-benefit analyses have been completed to evaluate each cultivation method. For the cultivation and biomass production of *S. obliquus* in wastewater, multi-purpose phycoremediation processes can be economically viable [70], this may be achieved through generating revenue after wastewater treatment while simultaneously producing algal feedstocks for fuel and fertilizer applications. Additionally, algal biofilm cultivation offers promising alternative approaches for cost-effective production of high-density biomass [130,131].

3. Cultivation of *Scenedesmus* sp. in wastewater from different sources

The cultivation and remediation potential of *Scenedesmus*-dominated systems have been evaluated in several types of wastewater (Tables 1 & 2). Using municipal wastewater effluents for the cultivation of *S. obliquus*, removal of N and P reached almost 100% after a few days, while total organic carbon (TOC) removal reached between 60% and 75% [4,68,69,94–104]. Simultaneously, biomass productivity was at ~578 mg L⁻¹ d⁻¹, and lipid productivity reached about 17 mg L⁻¹ d⁻¹ at 5% CO₂ aeration. Under these conditions, however, the productivity of *S. obliquus*-dominated cultures declined within 7 days, as bacterial contamination increased [4]. More recently, uptake of nutrients from municipal wastewater, and simultaneous accumulation of lipids, carbohydrates, and proteins were analyzed in *S. obliquus*. Results confirmed nutrient removal efficiency of 81% NH₄⁺, 100% NO₃⁻, 94% PO₄³⁻, and 71% chemical oxygen demand (COD) after 16 days cultivation. Following algal biomass harvesting, protein, carbohydrate, and lipid contents were 28.5%, 27.5%, and 26.5% of dry biomass weight, respectively [70]. The growth and community dynamics of microalgal biofilms, pre-conditioned with wastewater and heavily inoculated with *S. obliquus*, was also monitored over an extended period of 26 days.

Table 2
Biomass production and composition of different *Scenedesmus* sp. reviewed here. Not available (N/A) means values were not reported in the research paper.

Microalgae	Media	Biomass productivity	Lipids	Proteins	Carbohydrates	CO ₂ level	Cultivation duration	Reference
<i>S. obliquus</i>	Municipal wastewater	578 mg L ⁻¹ d ⁻¹	17% dry weight	19% dry weight	64% dry weight	5%	6 days	[4]
<i>S. obliquus</i>	Municipal wastewater	85 mg L ⁻¹ d ⁻¹ ^a	26.5% dry weight	28.5% dry weight	27.5% dry weight	Ambient	16 days	[70]
<i>S. obliquus</i>	Poultry wastewater	N/A	27%	N/A	23%	Ambient	13 days	[71]
<i>S. obliquus</i>	Food wastewater	73 mg L ⁻¹ d ⁻¹	11 mg L ⁻¹ d ⁻¹	N/A	16 mg L ⁻¹ d ⁻¹	10%	6 days	[37]
<i>S. obliquus</i>	Brewery wastewater	100 mg L ⁻¹ d ⁻¹	27% dry weight	N/A	N/A	Ambient	9 days	[74]
Consortium w/ <i>Scenedesmus</i> sp.	10–15% municipal wastewater	2.64 g m ⁻² d ⁻¹	6.82% dry weight	54.5% dry weight	8.98% dry weight	6%	12 days	[73]
<i>S. quadricauda</i>	Dairy wastewater	72mg L ⁻¹ d ⁻¹ ^a	N/A	N/A	N/A	Ambient	8 days	[5]
<i>Scenedesmus</i> sp.	30% effluent urban wastewater	23 g m ⁻² d ⁻¹	2.3 g m ⁻² d ⁻¹	N/A	N/A	On demand	Semi-continuous	[7]

^a Calculated based on the linear growth rate reported.

Despite heavy seeding, *S. obliquus* population declined while other chlorophytes (e.g. *Chlorella*) and cyanobacteria (e.g. *Leptolyngbya*) presumably carried with the wastewater surpassed the seed inoculum [105]. In other studies, *S. obliquus* was also grown in agroindustry poultry effluent using flocculated wastewater demonstrating 97% removal of both N and P [71]. *S. obliquus* grown mixotrophically in food wastewater supplied with real flue gas (10% CO₂) (Table 1) showed highest biomass growth, measured as dry weight (DW), at 0.44 g DW L⁻¹ and total nitrogen removal at 22 mg L⁻¹ after 6 days cultivation. Lipid and carbohydrate productivities were at 11 and 16 mg L⁻¹ d⁻¹, respectively [37]. Furthermore, Hodaifa et al. [72] used N-deficient rinse water from olive oil extraction industry to grow *S. obliquus* [72]. This resulted in a major increase in mono and polyunsaturated fatty acids within the total lipid content extracted from the biomass. Lastly, brewery wastewater was also used to grow *S. obliquus* for biomass and lipid production [73,106]. Brewery wastewater containing large amounts of nutrients (Table 1) can cause serious environmental risks, if released without treatment. Under these conditions, *S. obliquus* biomass reached 0.9 g DW L⁻¹, while lipid content reached 27% of dry biomass weight after 9 days cultivation [73]. In brief, *S. obliquus* has been demonstrated to efficiently remove nutrients from a wide variety of wastewater streams.

A consortium of 15 microalgal isolates including *Scenedesmus* sp. was used to treat carpet industry effluents containing 10%–15% municipal sewage, under ambient air or high CO₂ (6%) levels [74]. Within 3 days, the consortium was able to assimilate almost 100% N and over 97% P from the growth medium. Algal protein content was high (~55%), while lipids and carbohydrates were low (Table 2) [74]. Mixed microalgal cultures comprising *Scenedesmus* sp. and *Chlorella* sp. also showed effective pesticides removal from agricultural wastewater effluents with maximum rates reaching ~100% for endosulfan and malathion, and ~75% for lindane and alachlor [107]. When utilizing *S. quadricauda* to treat dairy wastewater, this strain could grow in the culture medium and maximum biomass concentration reached within 8 days was about 0.5 g DW L⁻¹. Nutrient uptake including N, P, and TOC reached 86, 90, and 65%, respectively. Lipid analysis revealed a major increase in saturated fatty acids in *S. quadricauda* [5]. Other works investigated the growth of *Scenedesmus* sp. in synthetic wastewater or in effluents from the anaerobic digestion of urban wastewater, sparged with flue gas for on-demand CO₂ supply [7,108–110]. Under specific growth conditions of 30% effluent, *Scenedesmus* sp. biomass productivity reached 23 g m⁻² d⁻¹, while lipid productivity reached 2.3 g m⁻² d⁻¹ (Table 2) [7]. Growth and uptake of organic compounds using *Scenedesmus* sp. were also tested in paper and oil mill industry wastewaters [111], as well as textile wastewater [112]. These studies showed high-efficiency uptake of butyrate, propionate, and acetate reaching 98%, 97% and 95%, respectively, while *Scenedesmus* showed a growth rate of 0.53 g d⁻¹ [112]. Lastly, mutant strain *Scenedesmus* sp. Z-4 [113], grown in molasses wastewater, showed lipid productivity of ~95 mg L⁻¹ d⁻¹, and significant N and P removal reaching 90.5% and 88.6%, respectively [114].

The potential for biosorption and heavy metals uptake from tannery wastewater was tested using *Scenedesmus* sp., under laboratory conditions. These studies showed ~98% uptake of copper (Cu), zinc (Zn), chromium (Cr), and lead (Pb) from the growth media [115]. It was also shown that Pb accumulation in *Acutodesmus (Scenedesmus) obliquus* resulted in cell toxicity and reduction in pigment, protein, and monosaccharide contents [116]. Similarly, Cr(VI) removal by the microalga *S. incressatulus* was also evaluated in PBRs using synthetic effluents. Results from 2 studies show ~53% [75], or ~45% [76] Cr(VI)-removal efficiency, and a slight increase in the alga dry biomass. Cr(VI) is a cancer-causing agent produced through industrial processes, including leather tanning [76–78], and may be released into aquatic systems with generated wastewaters. Interestingly, under some conditions, more efficient inorganic nutrient uptake can occur when *Scenedesmus* sp. are co-cultured with other algae [75,79,117–122], bacteria [123–125], or

fungi [126], while others showed that single species used in the treatment of domestic wastewaters were more productive [7,20,70].

4. Heterotrophic and mixotrophic growth of *Scenedesmus* sp

As previously mentioned, microalgae can utilize organic substrates (monosaccharides, amino acids, or other exogenous compounds), and can shift between phototrophic, heterotrophic or mixotrophic growth [13,80]. However, the type and quantity of substrates that are utilized in mixed waste streams have not been investigated and most (if not all) of what is known about organic carbon utilization by *Scenedesmus* has been from laboratory studies with defined medium. The growth rate of phototrophic *S. obliquus* cells increased under heterotrophic growth conditions in the dark, in the presence of 1% glucose as the sole carbon source [81]. Moreover, *S. obliquus* cells grown mixotrophically in 1.5% glucose increased their lipid productivity to 270 mg L⁻¹ d⁻¹, which was 50-fold higher than in phototrophically-grown cells [82]. When *S. obliquus* was grown mixotrophically in minimal media (BG-11) containing xylose (4 g L⁻¹), cell density was ~3-fold higher than under phototrophic conditions [83]. Growth and biomass productivity of *S. obliquus* were also assessed in minimal media supplied with various concentrations of sodium bicarbonate, sodium chloride/sea water, glycerol, or sugarcane molasses. Among these growth conditions, high salinity (0.94 g L⁻¹ NaCl concentration or 25% sea water) resulted in the highest increase in growth and fatty acid content [36]. The observed increase in lipid content in *S. obliquus* at higher salinity levels was confirmed in other reports [84,85].

Supplementing phototrophic or mixotrophic cultures of *Scenedesmus* with high concentrations of CO₂ can increase photosynthetic capacity and carbon fixation, while reaching higher biomass productivity [87,127]. Cultures of *Scenedesmus* sp. supplied with flue gas containing 5.5% CO₂ reached a biomass productivity of 203 mg L⁻¹ d⁻¹ and lipid productivity of 39 mg L⁻¹ d⁻¹, which corresponds to about 18% lipid content [88]. In other studies, the highest growth rate of the microalga *S. dimorphus* was achieved with glucose at pH 5 under both heterotrophic and mixotrophic conditions. Nevertheless, not all organic carbon sources promote biomass productivity equally as cell growth gradually decreased when minimal medium was supplied with fructose, acetic acid, or proteose peptone [89]. Finally, biomass productivity of *S. bijuga* was evaluated under phototrophic, mixotrophic, and heterotrophic growth conditions [90]. During mixotrophic growth with 1% glucose, *S. bijuga* biomass increased ~6-fold compared to phototrophic growth, and ~4.5-fold compared to heterotrophic growth [90]. In short, a scant number of substrates have been tested for optimal mixotrophic or heterotrophic growth of a select number of *Scenedesmus* species. Collectively, biomass productivity in these species were generally much higher under mixotrophic conditions. However, the interplay between the different carbon sources and molecular mechanisms of carbon partitioning under these conditions is still unknown.

Scenedesmus central carbon metabolism

Understanding the molecular mechanisms of inorganic/organic carbon assimilation and sequestration, as well as advancing our knowledge of metabolic and gene regulatory networks will provide useful hypotheses for future strain development, as well as improvement of wastewater treatment efficacy and cultivation conditions to maximize algal biomass productivity. However, metabolic pathways in different microalgae can be flexible and diverse. Currently, a major gap in knowledge exists regarding the regulation of carbon fixation/uptake and partitioning in *Scenedesmus* sp. and other green algae. Moreover, the genetic basis for *Scenedesmus* growth response, as well as the regulatory and metabolic pathways governing cultivation in organic-rich wastewaters are largely unknown. Starch appears to be the preferred storage molecule under control, non-stress conditions, but under stress conditions, and particularly nutrient stress, starch and lipid

biosynthetic pathways compete for common precursors, such as Acetyl-CoA the main precursor of fatty acid synthesis, resulting in major accumulation of storage neutral lipids. Most of the other biochemical pathways remain uncharacterized. To gain this knowledge, a few researchers have sequenced the genomes and transcriptomes of a small number of *Scenedesmus* species chosen for their potential as biofuel production platforms. The genomes of *S. obliquus* DOE0152z, *S. quadricauda* LWG002611, and *Tetrademus (Scenedesmus) obliquus* UTEX393 were sequenced to identify the metabolic and regulatory pathways relevant to biofuel production [33,40,41]. Using the annotated genome of *S. quadricauda*, metabolic pathways relevant to carbon fixation and partitioning were reconstructed [33], revealing the presence of gene homologs encoding for enzymes active in alternative CO₂ uptake, as well as enzymes active in lipid and triacylglycerol (TAG) metabolism. Furthermore, using the draft assembly of the nuclear sequence from *T. obliquus* [41], core metabolic pathways essential for biomass formation, and energy production and maintenance were recently reconstructed for this strain [91].

Transcriptome analyses of the gene expression were also performed in a few *Scenedesmus* species to investigate the regulation mechanisms under conditions that trigger carbon partitioning to lipid and starch accumulation. Carreres et al. [43] compared the transcriptional changes in wild-type *T. obliquus* and a starchless mutant (*slm1*) growing in photobioreactors, under diurnal (16 h:8 h light:dark cycle) growth conditions. They found significant changes in expression of genes encoding for enzymes involved in carbohydrate metabolism under the analyzed conditions. In addition, starch deficiency in *slm1* resulted in impairments in energy production under dark conditions [43]. Nitrogen deprivation in the non-model microalga *S. acutus* resulted in the enhancement of lipid accumulation [42]. Differential gene expression analyses revealed the downregulation of genes involved in photosynthesis, TAG degradation, including several TAG lipases, as well as genes involved in starch synthesis. On the other hand, genes involved in starch degradation and glycolysis were upregulated [42]. Transcriptome analysis in *Scenedesmus* sp. was also performed under phosphorus starvation condition. Low P induced lipid accumulation, while carbohydrate content decreased [34]. The differential gene expression was consistent with these observations since genes encoding for diacylglycerol acyltransferase (DGAT) and pyruvate kinase were induced, and genes encoding for starch synthase and 1,4- α -glucan branching enzyme were downregulated [34]. Finally, a comparative transcriptomic analysis between *S. dimorphus* and *S. quadricauda* revealed differential lipid accumulation among these two species [92]. Results showed upregulation of genes involved in photosynthesis and carbon fixation in *S. dimorphus* compared to *S. quadricauda*. This may have induced higher lipid biosynthesis and accumulation in *S. dimorphus*. *Phosphoenolpyruvate Carboxylase (PEPC)* expression in the transcriptome of *S. dimorphus* was shown to be downregulated, while enolase, which catalyzes the production of phosphoenolpyruvate was induced [92]. Genes encoding for enzymes involved in the synthesis of Acetyl-CoA, as well as TAG biosynthesis were highly induced in *S. dimorphus* [92].

In summary, progress has been made towards defining the core carbon metabolic network in *Scenedesmus*. However, the metabolic pathways regulating the uptake of different organic compounds available from wastewater remain to be studied and validated experimentally. In addition, regulatory mechanisms governing carbon partitioning have not yet been identified, and the interplay between autotrophic and heterotrophic carbon sources has not been investigated. It is not known, for example, if the regulatory mechanisms involved the physiological transition from autotrophy to heterotrophy in *C. zofingensis* [28] function in *Scenedesmus* species.

5. Conclusions

Mixotrophic cultivation of *Scenedesmus* in nutrient rich wastewater

can enhance biomass production, modulate lipid and carbohydrate metabolism, and remediate the wastewater in an environmentally-sustainable manner. However, economically-viable algal systems that couple biofuel production with large-scale wastewater treatment are still limited by low algal biomass productivity and high production/operational costs [128]. While this literature review confirmed the ability of *Scenedesmus* sp. to grow in organic wastewater of different sources, and simultaneously remove unidentified inorganic nitrogen and phosphorus compounds, the effect of other organic substrates on the enhancement of *Scenedesmus* sp. biomass and lipid productivity should be studied in more detail. Furthermore, there are known differences in the regulation of carbon metabolism in evolutionarily-diverse microalgal classes, as well as within different *Scenedesmus* species [129]. More genomic information and the molecular and biochemical characterization of the key metabolic pathways would offer great advantages for the production and optimization of biofuel and/or other biomaterials. Different organic carbon and organic and mineral nitrogen substrates, easily acquired from domestic and agro-industrial wastewater sources, should also be tested as nutrient sources. Furthermore, genomic and transcriptomic studies have provided some insight into the basic carbon metabolism of *Scenedesmus* species. Expansion of these systems biology approaches are needed to inform genetic engineering strategies, and to fully understand carbon partitioning and the physiological conditions that maximize productivity and nutrient removal.

Author contributions

JM and SS initially planned the outline and wrote the review, JP and SS contributed to the collection of references and reviewed and edited the text.

Declaration of competing interest

The authors declare that there is no conflict of financial or personal interests.

Acknowledgments

This work was supported by the Bioenergy Technology Office within the US Department of Energy Office of Energy Efficiency and Renewable Energy through contract NL0029949 (WBS 1.3.1.600).

Statement of informed consent, human/animal rights

No conflicts, informed consent, or human or animal rights applicable to this study.

References

- [1] E.J. Olguin, Phycoremediation: key issues for cost-effective nutrient removal processes, *Biotechnol. Adv.* 22 (2003) 81–91.
- [2] K. Larsdotter, Wastewater treatment with microalgae – a literature review, *Sol. Energy* 62 (2006) 31–38.
- [3] L. Wang, M. Min, Y. Li, P. Chen, Y. Chen, Y. Liu, Y. Wang, R. Ruan, Cultivation of green algae *Chlorella* sp. in different wastewaters from municipal wastewater treatment plant, *Appl. Biochem. Biotechnol.* 162 (4) (2010) 1174–1186.
- [4] Q.-H. Shen, J.-W. Jiang, L.-P. Chen, L.-H. Cheng, X.-H. Xu, H.-L. Chen, Effect of carbon source on biomass growth and nutrients removal of *Scenedesmus obliquus* for wastewater advanced treatment and lipid production, *Bioresour. Technol.* 190 (2015) 257–263.
- [5] E. Daneshvar, M.J. Zarrinmehr, A.M. Hashitjin, O. Farhadian, A. Bhatnagar, Versatile applications of freshwater and marine water microalgae in dairy wastewater treatment, lipid extraction and tetracycline biosorption, *Bioresour. Technol.* 268 (2018) 523–530.
- [6] S. Greses, N. Zamorano-Lopez, L. Borrás, J. Ferrer, A. Seco, D. Aguado, Effect of long residence time and high temperature over anaerobic biodegradation of *Scenedesmus* microalgae grown in wastewater, *J. Environ. Manag.* 218 (2018) 425–434.
- [7] A. Jebali, F.G. Ación, E.R. Barradas, E.J. Olguín, S. Sayadi, E.M. Grima, Pilot-scale outdoor production of *Scenedesmus* sp. in raceways using flue gases and centrate from anaerobic digestion as the sole culture medium, *Bioresour. Technol.* 262 (2018) 1–8.
- [8] G.A. Oliveira, E. Carissimi, I. Monje-Ramírez, S.B. Velasquez-Orta, R.T. Rodrigues, M.T.O. Ledesma, Comparison between coagulation-flocculation and ozone-flotation for *Scenedesmus* microalgal biomolecule recovery and nutrient removal from wastewater in a high-rate algal pond, *Bioresour. Technol.* 259 (2018) 334–342.
- [9] W. Qi, S. Mei, Y. Yuan, X. Li, T. Tang, Q. Zhao, M. Wu, W. Wei, Y. Sun, Enhancing fermentation wastewater treatment by co-culture of microalgae with volatile fatty acid- and alcohol-degrading bacteria, *Algal Res.* 31 (2018) 31–39.
- [10] J.Y. An, S.J. Sim, J.S. Lee, B.W. Kim, Hydrocarbon production from secondarily treated piggery wastewater by the green alga *Botryococcus braunii*, *J. Appl. Phycol.* 15 (2003) 185–191.
- [11] Q. Hongjin, W. Guangce, Effect of carbon source on growth and lipid accumulation in *Chlorella sorokiniana* GXNN01, *Chin. J. Oceanol. Limnol.* 27 (2009) 762–768.
- [12] V. Vasudevan, R.W. Stratton, M.N. Pearson, G.R. Jersey, A.G. Beyene, J.C. Weissman, M. Rubino, J.I. Hileman, Environmental performance of algal biofuel technology options, *Environ. Sci. Technol.* 46 (2012) 2451–2459.
- [13] J.N. Rosenberg, N. Kobayashi, A. Barnes, E.A. Noel, M.J. Betenbaugh, G.A. Oyler, Comparative analyses of three *Chlorella* species in response to light and sugar reveal distinctive lipid accumulation patterns in the microalga *C. sorokiniana*, *PLoS One* 9 (2014) e92460.
- [14] W.J. Oswald, High rate ponds in waste disposal, *Dev. Ind. Microbiol.* 4 (1963) 112–119.
- [15] J.R. Benemann, Biofixation of CO₂ and Greenhouse Gas Abatement with Microalgae - Technology Roadmap, Report No. 7010000926 prepared for the U.S. Department of Energy National energy technology laboratory (2003).
- [16] R.J. Craggs, S. Heubeck, T.J. Lundquist, J.R. Benemann, Algal biofuel from wastewater treatment high rate algal ponds, *Water Sci. Technol.* 63 (2011) 660–665.
- [17] J.B.K. Park, R.J. Craggs, A.N. Shilton, Enhancing biomass energy yield from pilot-scale high rate algal ponds with recycling, *Water Res.* 47 (2013) 4422–4432.
- [18] A.E. Marchello, A.T. Lombardi, M.J. Dellamano-Oliveira, C.W. de Souza, Microalgae population dynamics in photobioreactors with secondary sewage effluent as culture medium, *Braz. J. Microbiol.* 46 (2015) 75–84.
- [19] A. Mehrabadi, R. Craggs, M.M. Farid, Biodiesel production potential of wastewater treatment high rate algal pond biomass, *Bioresour. Technol.* 221 (2016) 222–233.
- [20] N. Shchegolkova, K. Shurshin, S. Pogosyan, E. Voronova, D. Matorin, D. Karyakin, Microalgae cultivation for wastewater treatment and biogas production at Moscow wastewater treatment plant, *Water Sci. Technol.* 78 (2018) 69–80.
- [21] Y. Feng, C. Li, D. Zhang, Lipid production of *Chlorella vulgaris* cultured in artificial wastewater medium, *Bioresour. Technol.* 102 (2011) 101–105.
- [22] M.S. de Alva, V.M. Luna-Pabello, E. Cadena, E. Ortiz, Green microalga *Scenedesmus acutus* grown on municipal wastewater to couple nutrient removal with lipid accumulation for biodiesel production, *Bioresour. Technol.* 46 (2013) 744–48.
- [23] M. Arif, Y. Bai, M. Usman, M. Jalalah, F.A. Harraz, M.S. Al-Assiri, X. Li, E.S. Salama, C. Zhang, Highest accumulated microalgal lipids (polar and non-polar) for biodiesel production with advanced wastewater treatment: role of lipidomics, *Bioresour. Technol.* 298 (2020) 122299, <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.biortech.2019.122299>.
- [24] M.A. Borowitzka, L.J. Borowitzka, *Microalgal Biotechnology*, Cambridge University Press, Cambridge, 1988, p. 390.
- [25] F. Chen, M.R. Johns, Effect of C/N ratio and aeration on the fatty acid composition of heterotrophic *Chlorella sorokiniana*, *J. Appl. Phycol.* 3 (1991) 203–209.
- [26] M.A. Borowitzka, Commercial production of microalgae: ponds, tanks, tubes and fermenters, *J. Biotechnol.* 70 (1999) 313–321.
- [27] C. Gao, Y. Wang, Y. Shen, D. Yan, X. He, J. Dai, Q. Wu, Oil accumulation mechanisms of the oleaginous microalga *Chlorella protothecoides* revealed through its genome, transcriptomes, and proteomes, *BMC Genomics* 15 (1) (2014) 582.
- [28] M.S. Roth, S.D. Gallaher, D.J. Westcott, M. Iwai, K.B. Louie, M. Mueller, A. Walter, F. Foflonker, B.P. Bowen, N.N. Ataii, J. Song, J.-H. Chen, C.E. Blaby-Haas, C. Larabell, M. Auer, T.R. Northen, S.S. Merchant, K.K. Niyogia, Regulation of oxygenic photosynthesis during trophic transitions in the green alga *Chromochloris zofingiensis*, *Plant Cell* 31 (3) (2019) 579–601.
- [29] S. Fierro, M. del Pilar Sanchez-Saavedra, C. Copalcaua, Nitrate and phosphate removal by chitosan immobilized *Scenedesmus*, *Bioresour. Technol.* 99 (2008) 1274–1279.
- [30] I. Woertz, A. Feffer, T. Lundquist, Y. Nelson, Igae grown on dairy and municipal wastewater for simultaneous nutrient removal and lipid production for biofuel feedstock, *J. Environ. Eng.* 135 (2009) 1115–1122.
- [31] Z. Liang, Y. Liu, Y. Xu, N. Tao, F. Peng, M. Wong, Efficiency assessment and pH effect in removing nitrogen and phosphorus by algae-bacteria combined system of *Chlorella vulgaris* and *Bacillus licheniformis*, *Chemosphere* 92 (2013) 1383–1389.
- [32] F. Gentili, Microalgal biomass and lipid production in mixed municipal, dairy, pulp and paper wastewater together with added flue gases, *Bioresour. Technol.* 169 (2014) 27–32.
- [33] C.N. Dasgupta, S. Nayaka, K. Toppo, A.K. Singh, U. Deshpande, A. Mohapatra, Draft genome sequence and detailed characterization of biofuel production by oleaginous microalga *Scenedesmus quadricauda* LWG002611, *Biotechnology for Biofuels* 11 (2018) 308.
- [34] F. Yang, W. Xiang, T. Li, L. Long, Transcriptome analysis for phosphorus starvation-induced lipid accumulation in *Scenedesmus* sp., *Sci. Rep.* 8 (2018) 16420.
- [35] T.R. Shamala, F. Drawert, G. Leupold, Studies on *Scenedesmus acutus* growth. I. Effect of autotrophic and mixotrophic conditions on the growth of *Scenedesmus acutus*, *Biotechnol. Bioeng.* 24 (6) (1982) 1287–1299.
- [36] M. El-Sheekh, A. Abomohra, H. Dieter, Optimization of biomass and fatty acid productivity of *Scenedesmus obliquus* as a promising microalga for biodiesel

- production, World J. Microbiol. Biotechnol. 29 (2013) 915–922.
- [37] M.-K. Ji, H.-S. Yun, Y.-T. Park, A.N. Kabra, L.-H. Oh, J. Choi, Mixotrophic cultivation of a microalga *Scenedesmus obliquus* in municipal wastewater supplemented with food wastewater and flue gas CO₂ for biomass production, J. Environ. Manag. 159 (2015) 115–120.
- [38] K. Xu, H. Jiang, P. Juneau, B. Qiu, Comparative studies on the photosynthetic responses of three freshwater phytoplankton species to temperature and light regimes, J. Appl. Phycol. 24 (2012) 1113–1122.
- [39] D.E. Brune, T.J. Lundquist, J.R. Benemann, Microalgal biomass for greenhouse gas reductions: potential for replacement of fossil fuels and animal feeds, J. Environ. Eng. (2009), [https://doi.org/10.1061/\(ASCE\)EE.1943-7870.0000100](https://doi.org/10.1061/(ASCE)EE.1943-7870.0000100).
- [40] S.R. Starckenburg, J.E.W. Polle, B. Hovde, H.E. Daligault, K.W. Davenport, A. Huang, P. Neofotis, Z. McKie-Krisberg, Draft nuclear genome, complete chloroplast genome, and complete mitochondrial genome for the biofuel/bioproduct feedstock species *Scenedesmus obliquus* strain DOE0152z, Genome Announcements 5 (2017) e00617.
- [41] B.M. Carreres, L. de Jaeger, J. Springer, M.J. Barbosa, G. Breuer, E.J. van den End, D.M.M. Kleinegris, I. Schäffers, E.J.H. Wolbert, H. Zhang, P.P. Lamers, R.B. Draaisma, V.A. Martins Dos Santos, R.H. Wijffels, G. Eggink, P.J. Schaap, D.E. Martens, Draft genome sequence of the oleaginous green alga *Tetradismus obliquus* UTEX 393, Genome Announcements 5 (2017) e01449-16.
- [42] A. Sirikhachornkit, A. Suttangkakul, S. Vuttipongchaikij, P. Juntawong, *De novo* transcriptome analysis and gene expression profiling of an oleaginous microalga *Scenedesmus acutus* TISTR8540 during nitrogen deprivation-induced lipid accumulation, Sci. Rep. 8 (2018) 3668.
- [43] B.M. Carreres, G.M. León-Saiki, P.J. Schaap, I.M. Remmers, D. van der Veen, V.A.P. Martins Dos Santos, R.H. Wijffels, D.E. Martens, M. Suarez-Diez, The diurnal transcriptional landscape of the microalga *Tetradismus obliquus*, Algal Res. 40 (2019) 101477.
- [44] M. Dareioti, S.N. Dokianakis, K. Stamatelatou, C. Zafiri, M. Kornaros, Biogas production from anaerobic co-digestion of agroindustrial wastewaters under mesophilic conditions in a two-stage process, Desalination 248 (2009) 891–906.
- [45] P. Sanchis-Perucho, F. Duran, R. Barat, M. Pachés, D. Aguado, Microalgae population dynamics growth with AnMBR effluent: effect of light and phosphorus concentration, Water Sci. Technol. 77 (2018) 2566–2577.
- [46] J.C. Weissman, R.P. Goebel, J.R. Benemann, Photobioreactor design: comparison of open ponds and tubular reactors, Bioengineering and Biotechnology 31 (1988) 336–344.
- [47] A. Richmond, S. Boussiba, A. Vonshak, R. Kopel, A new tubular reactor for mass production of microalgae outdoors, J. Appl. Phycol. 5 (1993) 327–332.
- [48] J. Sheehan, T. Dunahay, J. Benemann, P. Roessler, A Look Back at the U.S. Department of Energy's Aquatic Species Program - Biodiesel from Algae, National Renewable Energy Laboratory, Golden, CO, 1998 80401 NERL/TP-580-24190.
- [49] W.J. Oswald, C.G. Golueke, Biological transformation of solar energy, Adv. Appl. Microbiol. 2 (1960) 223–262.
- [50] J.C. Weissman, R.P. Goebel, Design and Analysis of Microalgal Open Pond Systems for the Purpose of Producing Fuels, A Subcontract Report, U.S. Department of Energy, 1987, http://www.osti.gov/bridge/product.biblio.jsp?query_id=0&page=0&osti_id=6546458.
- [51] J. De la Noüe, N. De Pauw, The potential of microalgal biotechnology: a review of production and uses of microalgae, Biotechnol. Adv. 6 (1988) 725–770.
- [52] W.J. Oswald, Large-scale culture systems (engineering aspects), in: M.A. Borowitzka, L.J. Borowitzka (Eds.), Micro-Algal Biotechnology, Cambridge University Press, Cambridge, 1988, pp. 357–394.
- [53] J.R. Benemann, W.J. Oswald, Systems and Economic Analysis of Microalgal Ponds for Conversion of CO₂ to Biomass, Final Report, U.S. Department of Energy, 1996, <http://www.osti.gov/bridge/servlets/purl/493389-FXQyZ2/webviewable/493389.pdf>.
- [54] R.J. McGrath, I.G. Mason, An observational method for the assessment of biogas production from an anaerobic waste stabilization pond treating farm dairy wastewater, Biosyst. Eng. 87 (2004) 471–478.
- [55] C. Sophonsiri, E. Morgenroth, Chemical composition associated with different particle size fractions in municipal, industrial, and agricultural wastewaters, Chemosphere 55 (2004) 691–703.
- [56] J. Park, R. Craggs, Biogas production from anaerobic waste stabilisation ponds treating dairy and piggyery wastewater in New Zealand, Water Sci. Technol. 55 (2007) 257–264.
- [57] T. Lundquist, I. Woertz, N. Quinn, J.R. Benemann, A Realistic Technology and Engineering Assessment of Algae Biofuel Production, Energy Biosciences Institute, Berkeley, California, 2010, pp. 1–178.
- [58] R. Craggs, J. Park, S. Heubeck, D. Sutherland, High rate algal pond systems for low-energy wastewater treatment, nutrient recovery and energy production, N. Z. J. Bot. 52 (1) (2014) 60–73.
- [59] Q.X. Kong, L. Li, B. Martinez, P. Chen, R. Ruan, Culture of microalgae *Chlamydomonas reinhardtii* in wastewater for biomass feedstock production, Appl. Biochem. Biotechnol. 160 (2010) 9–18.
- [60] J.R. Benemann, B.L. Koopman, D.C. Baker, R.P. Goebel, W.J. Oswald, Design of the Algal Pond Subsystem of the Photosynthetic Energy Factory, Final Report for the US Energy Research and Development Administration, Contract Number: EX-76-(01-2548), Report no. 78-4 SERL, Colorado, USA, 1980.
- [61] D.M. Eisenberg, B.L. Koopman, J.R. Benemann, W.J. Oswald, Algal bioflocculation and energy conservation in algae sewage ponds, Bioengineering and Biotechnology 11 (1981) 429–448.
- [62] S. Heubeck, R.J. Craggs, A. Shilton, Influence of CO₂ scrubbing from biogas on the treatment performance of a high rate algal pond, Water Sci. Technol. 55 (2007) 193–200.
- [63] J.B.K. Park, R.J. Craggs, Wastewater treatment and algal production in high rate algal ponds with carbon dioxide addition, Water Sci. Technol. 61 (2010) 633–639.
- [64] J.B.K. Park, R.J. Craggs, Nutrient removal in high rate algal ponds with CO₂ addition, Water Sci. Technol. 63 (2011) 1758–1764.
- [65] F.B. Green, L. Bernstone, T.J. Lundquist, W.J. Oswald, Advanced integrated wastewater pond systems for nitrogen removal, Water Sci. Technol. 33 (7) (1996) 207–217.
- [66] R.J. Craggs, R.J. Davies-Colley, C.C. Tanner, J.P.S. Sukias, Advanced ponds systems: performance with high rate ponds of different depths and areas, Water Sci. Technol. 48 (2) (2003) 259–267.
- [67] P. Das, M.I. Thaher, M.A.Q.M. Abdul Hakim, H.M.S.J. Al-Jabri, G.S.H.S. Alghasal, Microalgae harvesting by pH adjusted coagulation-flocculation, recycling of the coagulant and the growth media, Bioresour. Technol. 216 (2016) 824–829.
- [68] L. Gouveia, S. Graça, C. Sousa, et al., Microalgae biomass production using wastewater: treatment and costs: scale-up considerations, Algal Res. 16 (2016) 167–176.
- [69] S.K. Gupta, F.A. Ansari, A. Shrivastav, et al., Dual role of *Chlorella sorokiniana* and *Scenedesmus obliquus* for comprehensive wastewater treatment and biomass production for bio-fuels, J. Clean. Prod. 115 (2016) 255–264.
- [70] F.A. Ansari, B. Ravindran, S.K. Gupta, M. Nasr, I. Rawat, F. Bux, Techno-economic estimation of wastewater phycoremediation and environmental benefits using *Scenedesmus obliquus* microalgae, J. Environ. Manag. 240 (2019) 293–302.
- [71] A.C. Oliveira, A. Barata, A.P. Batista, L. Gouveia, *Scenedesmus obliquus* in poultry wastewater bioremediation, Environ. Technol. 40 (28) (2019) 3735–3744, <https://doi.org/10.1080/09593330.2018.1488003>.
- [72] G. Hodaifa, M.E. Martínez, S. Sánchez, Use of industrial wastewater from olive-oil extraction for biomass production of *Scenedesmus obliquus*, Bioresour. Technol. 99 (2008) 1111–1117.
- [73] T.M. Mata, A.C. Melo, S. Meireles, A.M. Mendes, A.A. Martins, N.S. Caetano, Potential of microalgae *Scenedesmus obliquus* grown in brewery wastewater for biodiesel production, Chem. Eng. Trans. 32 (2013) 901–906.
- [74] S. Chinnasamy, A. Bhatnagar, R.W. Hunt, K.C. Das, Microalgae cultivation in a wastewater dominated by carpet mill effluents for biofuel applications, Bioresour. Technol. 101 (2010) 3097–3105.
- [75] J.M. Peña-Castro, F. Martínez-Jerónimo, F. Esparza-García, R.O. Cañizares-Villanueva, Heavy metals removal by the microalga *Scenedesmus incrassatulus* in continuous cultures, Bioresour. Technol. 94 (2004) 219–222.
- [76] C.R. Jacome-Pilco, E. Cristiani-Urbina, L.B. Flores-Cotera, R. Velasco-Garcia, T. Ponce-Noyola, R.O. Canizares-Villanueva, Continuous Cr(VI) removal by *Scenedesmus incrassatulus* in an airlift photobioreactor, Bioresour. Technol. 100 (2009) 2388–2391.
- [77] N. Ahalya, R.D. Kanamadi, T.V. Ramachandra, Biosorption of chromium (VI) from aqueous solutions by the husk of Bengal gram (*Cicer arietinum*), Electron. J. Biotechnol. 8 (2005) 258–264.
- [78] A. Baral, R. Engelken, W. Stephens, J. Farris, R. Hannigan, Evaluation of aquatic toxicities of chromium and chromium-containing effluents in reference to chromium electroplating industries, Arch. Environ. Contam. Toxicol. 50 (2006) 496–502.
- [79] M. Stockenreiter, F. Haupt, J. Seppälä, et al., Nutrient uptake and lipid yield in diverse microalgal communities grown in wastewater, Algal Res. 15 (2016) 77–82.
- [80] J. Liu, J. Huang, Z. Sun, Y. Zhong, Y. Jiang, F. Chen, Differential lipid and fatty acid profiles of photoautotrophic and heterotrophic *Chlorella zofingiensis*: assessment of algal oils for biodiesel production, Bioresour. Technol. 102 (2011) 106–110.
- [81] A. Abeliovich, D. Weisman, Role of heterotrophic nutrition in growth of the alga *Scenedesmus obliquus* in high-rate oxidation ponds, Appl. Environ. Microbiol. 35 (1978) 32–37.
- [82] S. Mandal, N. Mallick, Microalga *Scenedesmus obliquus* as a potential source for biodiesel production, Appl. Microbiol. Biotechnol. 84 (2009) 281–291.
- [83] S. Yang, G. Liu, Y. Meng, P. Wang, S. Zhou, H. Shang, Utilization of xylose as a carbon source for mixotrophic growth of *Scenedesmus obliquus*, Bioresour. Technol. 172 (2014) 180–185.
- [84] S. Ruangsomboon, M. Ganmanee, S. Choochote, Effects of different nitrogen, phosphorus, and iron concentrations and salinity on lipid production in newly isolated strain of the tropical green microalga, *Scenedesmus dimorphus* KMITL, J. Appl. Phycol. 25 (3) (2013) 867–874.
- [85] E.S. Salama, H.C. Kim, R.A. Abou-Shanab, M.K. Ji, Y.K. Oh, S.H. Kim, B.H. Jeon, Biomass, lipid content, and fatty acid composition of freshwater *Chlamydomonas mexicana* and *Scenedesmus obliquus* grown under salt stress, Bioprocess Biosyst. Eng. 36 (6) (2013) 827–833.
- [86] E.S. Salama, A.N. Kabra, M.K. Ji, J.R. Kim, B. Min, B.H. Jeon, Enhancement of microalgae growth and fatty acid content under the influence of phytohormones, Bioresour. Technol. 172 (2014) 97–103.
- [87] R. Praveenkumar, B. Kim, E. Choi, K. Lee, J.Y. Park, J.S. Lee, Y.C. Lee, Y.K. Oh, Improved biomass and lipid production in a mixotrophic culture of *Chlorella* sp. KR-1 with addition of coal-fired flue-gas, Bioresour. Technol. 171 (2014) 500–505.
- [88] C. Yoo, S.-Y. Jun, J.-Y. Lee, C.-Y. Ahn, H.-M. Oh, Selection of microalgae for lipid production under high levels carbon dioxide, Bioresour. Technol. 101 (2010) S71–S74.
- [89] S. Siong, Ling Chee, Heterotrophic Cultivation of Microalgae, *Scenedesmus dimorphus*, Universiti Malaysia Sarawak, 2011.
- [90] A. Bhatnagar, S. Chinnasamy, M. Singh, K.C. Das, Renewable biomass production by mixotrophic algae in the presence of various carbon sources and wastewaters, Appl. Energy 88 (2011) 3425–3431.
- [91] G.M. León-Saiki, N. Ferrer Ledo, D. Lao-Martil, D. van der Veen, R.H. Wijffels, D.E. Martens, Metabolic modelling and energy parameter estimation of

- Tetrademus obliquus*, Algal Res. 35 (2018) 378–387.
- [92] T. Sharma, R.S. Chauhan, Comparative transcriptomics reveals molecular components associated with differential lipid accumulation between microalgal sp., *Scenedesmus dimorphus* and *Scenedesmus quadricauda*, Algal Res. 19 (2016) 109–122.
- [93] G. Deviram, T. Mathimani, S. Anto, T.S. Ahamed, D.A. Ananth, A. Pugazhendhi, Applications of microalgal and cyanobacterial biomass on a way to safe, cleaner and a sustainable environment, J. Clean. Prod. 253 (2020) 119770.
- [94] C. Zhang, Y. Zhang, B. Zhuang, X. Zhou, Strategic enhancement of algal biomass, nutrient uptake and lipid through statistical optimization of nutrient supplementation in coupling *Scenedesmus obliquus*-like microalgae cultivation and municipal wastewater treatment, Bioresour. Technol. 171 (2014) 71e79.
- [95] J.C. Nzayisenga, X. Farge, S.L. Groll, A. Sellstedt, Effects of light intensity on growth and lipid production in microalgae grown in wastewater, Biotechnology for Biofuels 13 (2020) 4, <https://doi.org/10.1186/s13068-019-1646-x>.
- [96] P. Álvarez-Díaz, J. Ruiz, Z. Arbib, J. Barragán, M. Garrido-Pérez, J. Perales, Freshwater microalgae selection for simultaneous wastewater nutrient removal and lipid production, Algal Res. 24 (2017) 477–485.
- [97] A. Shahid, S. Malik, H. Zhu, J. Xu, M.Z. Nawaz, S. Nawaz, M.A. Alam, M.A. Mehmood, Cultivating microalgae in wastewater for biomass production, pollutant removal, and atmospheric carbon mitigation; a review, Sci. Total Environ. 704 (2020) 135303.
- [98] X. Chen, Z. Hu, Y. Qi, C. Song, G. Chen, The interactions of algae-activated sludge symbiotic system and its effects on wastewater treatment and lipid accumulation, Bioresour. Technol. 292 (2019) 122017.
- [99] C.S. Lee, H.-S. Oh, H.-M. Oh, H.-S. Kim, C.-Y. Ahn, Two-phase photoperiodic cultivation of algal-bacterial consortia for high biomass production and efficient nutrient removal from municipal wastewater, Bioresour. Technol. 200 (2016) 867–875.
- [100] L.E. Walls, S.B. Velasquez-Orta, E. Romero-Frasca, P. Leary, I.Y. Noguez, M.T.O. Ledesma, Non-sterile heterotrophic cultivation of native wastewater yeast and microalgae for integrated municipal wastewater treatment and bioethanol production, Biochem. Eng. J. 151 (2019) 107319.
- [101] L. Qin, Z. Wang, Y. Sun, Q. Shu, P. Feng, L. Zhu, et al., Microalgae consortia cultivation in dairy wastewater to improve the potential of nutrient removal and biodiesel feedstock production, Environ. Sci. Pollut. Res. 23 (2016) 8379–8387.
- [102] Z. Qu, P. Duan, X. Cao, M. Liu, L. Lin, M. Li, Comparison of monoculture and mixed culture (*Scenedesmus obliquus* and wild algae) for C, N, and P removal and lipid production, Environ. Sci. Pollut. Res. 26 (20) (2019) 20961–20968.
- [103] M. Martínez, Nitrogen and phosphorus removal from urban wastewater by the microalga *Scenedesmus obliquus*, Bioresour. Technol. 73 (2000) 263–272.
- [104] J.T. Bunce, E. Ndam, I.D. Ofteru, A. Moore, D.W. Graham, A review of phosphorus removal technologies and their applicability to small-scale domestic wastewater treatment systems, Frontiers in Environmental Science 6 (8) (2018), <https://doi.org/10.3389/fenvs.2018.00008>.
- [105] A.J. Paquette, C.E. Sharp, P.J. Schnurr, D.G. Allen, S.M. Short, G.S. Espie, Dynamic changes in community composition of *Scenedesmus*-seeded artificial, engineered microalgal biofilms, Algal Res. 46 (2020) 101805.
- [106] X. Wu, C. Yan, H. Zheng, S. Luo, Y. Liu, W. Li, et al., Fixing CO₂ and treating wastewater from beer brewery using microalgae, Journal of Biobased Materials and Bioenergy 11 (2017) 101–105.
- [107] V. Matamoros, Y. Rodríguez, Batch vs continuous-feeding operational mode for the removal of pesticides from agricultural run-off by microalgae systems: a laboratory scale study, J. Hazard. Mater. 309 (2016) 126–132.
- [108] M. Prasad, A. Varma, P. Kumari, P. Mondal, Production of lipid-containing microalgal biomass and simultaneous removal of nitrate and phosphate from synthetic wastewater, Environ. Technol. 39 (5) (2017) 669–681.
- [109] S. Yewalkar-Kulkarni, G. Gera, S. Nene, K. Pandare, B. Kulkarni, S. Kamble, Exploiting phosphate-starved cells of *Scenedesmus* sp. for the treatment of raw sewage, Indian J. Microbiol. 57 (2017) 241–249.
- [110] N. Apandi, R.M.S.R. Mohamed, A. Al-Gheethi, P. Gani, A. Ibrahim, A.H.M. Kassim, *Scenedesmus* biomass productivity and nutrient removal from wet market wastewater, a bio-kinetic study, Waste Biomass Valorization 10 (10) (2019) 2783–2800.
- [111] S. Bhattacharya, S.K. Pramanik, P.S. Gehlot, H. Patel, T. Gajaria, S. Mishra, et al., Process for preparing value-added products from microalgae using textile effluent through a biorefinery approach, ACS Sustainable Chemistry and Engineering 5 (11) (2017) 10019–10028.
- [112] C.-Y. Lin, M.-L.T. Nguyen, C.-H. Lay, Starch-containing textile wastewater treatment for biogas and microalgae biomass production, J. Clean. Prod. 168 (2017) 331–337.
- [113] B. Liu, C. Ma, R. Xiao, D. Xing, H. Ren, N. Ren, The screening of microalgae mutant strain *Scenedesmus* sp. Z-4 with a rich lipid content obtained by ⁶⁰Co γ-ray mutation, RSC Adv. 5 (64) (2015) 52057–52061.
- [114] C. Ma, H. Wen, D. Xing, X. Pei, J. Zhu, N. Ren, B. Liu, Molasses wastewater treatment and lipid production at low temperature conditions by a microalgal mutant *Scenedesmus* sp. Z-4, Biotechnology for Biofuels 10 (1) (2017) 111.
- [115] K.V. Ajayan, M. Selvaraju, P. Unnikannan, P. Sruthi, Phycoremediation of tannery wastewater using microalgae *Scenedesmus* species, International Journal of Phytoremediation 17 (2015) 907–916.
- [116] A. Piotrowska-Niczyporuk, A. Bajguz, M. Talarek, M. Bralska, E. Zambrzycka, The effect of lead on the growth, content of primary metabolites, and antioxidant response of green alga *Acutodesmus obliquus* (Chlorophyceae), Environ. Sci. Pollut. Res. 22 (2015) 19112–19123.
- [117] M. Huy, G. Kumar, H.-W. Kim, S.-H. Kim, Photoautotrophic cultivation of mixed microalgae consortia using various organic waste streams towards remediation and resource recovery, Bioresour. Technol. 247 (2018) 576–581.
- [118] F. Wallmann, S. Dietze, J.-U. Ackermann, T. Bley, T. Walther, J. Steingroewer, F. Krujatz, Microalgae wastewater treatment: biological and technological approaches, Engineering in Life Sciences 19 (2019) 860–871.
- [119] M. Raeissadati, A. Vadiveloo, P.A. Bahri, D. Parlevliet, N.R. Moheimani, Treating anaerobically digested piggyery effluent (ADPE) using microalgae in thin layer reactor and raceway pond, J. Appl. Phycol. 31 (4) (2019) 2311–2319.
- [120] S. Hena, S. Fatimah, S. Tabassum, Cultivation of algae consortium in a dairy farm wastewater for biodiesel production, Water Resource and Industry 10 (2015) 1–14.
- [121] L. Novovesk, A.K.M. Zapata, J.B. Zabolotney, M.C. Atwood, et al., Optimizing microalgae cultivation and wastewater treatment in large-scale offshore photobioreactors, Algal Res. 18 (2016) 86–94.
- [122] L.E. Gonzalez, R.O. Caizares, S. Baena, Efficiency of ammonia and phosphorus removal from a Colombian agroindustrial wastewater by the microalgae *Chlorella vulgaris* and *Scenedesmus dimorphus*, Bioresour. Technol. 60 (1997) 259–262.
- [123] F. Wang, B. Gao, M. Su, C. Dai, L. Huang, C. Zhang, Integrated biorefinery strategy for tofu wastewater biotransformation and biomass valorization with the filamentous microalga *Tribonema minus*, Bioresour. Technol. 292 (2019) 121938.
- [124] M. Wang, S.-C. Zhang, Q. Tang, L.-D. Shi, X.-M. Tao, G.-M. Tian, Organic degrading bacteria and nitrifying bacteria stimulate the nutrient removal and biomass accumulation in microalgae-based system from piggyery digestate, Sci. Total Environ. 707 (2019) 134442.
- [125] B.-G. Ryu, J. Kim, J.-I. Han, J.-W. Yang, Feasibility of using a microalgal-bacterial consortium for treatment of toxic coke wastewater with concomitant production of microbial lipids, Bioresour. Technol. 225 (2017) 58–66.
- [126] S. Srinuanpan, A. Chawpraknoi, S. Chantarit, B. Cheirsilp, P. Prasertsan, A rapid method for harvesting and immobilization of oleaginous microalgae using pellet-forming filamentous fungi and the application in phytoremediation of secondary effluent, International Journal of Phytoremediation 20 (2018) 1017–1024.
- [127] B. Zhu, G. Chen, X. Cao, D. Wei, Molecular characterization of CO₂ sequestration and assimilation in microalgae and its biotechnological applications, Bioresour. Technol. 244 (2) (2017) 1207–1215.
- [128] J.K. Pittman, A.P. Dean, O. Osundeko, The potential of sustainable algal biofuel production using wastewater resources, Bioresour. Technol. 102 (2011) 17–25.
- [129] S.C. Maberly, C. Courcelle, G.R. Groben, B. Gontero, Hylogenetically based variation in the regulation of the Calvin cycle enzymes, phosphoribulokinase and glyceraldehyde-3-phosphate dehydrogenase, in algae, J. Exp. Bot. 61 (2010) 735–745.
- [130] M. Gross, Z. Wen, Yearlong evaluation of performance and durability of a pilot-scale revolving algal biofilm (RAB) cultivation system, Bioresour. Technol. 171 (2014) 50–58.
- [131] M. Gross, V. Mascarenhas, Z. Wen, Evaluating algal growth performance and water use efficiency of pilot-scale revolving algal biofilm (RAB) culture systems, Biotechnol. Bioeng. 112 (2015) 2040–2050.
- [132] M.K. Kim, J.W. Park, C.S. Park, S.J. Kim, K.H. Jeune, M.U. Chang, J. Acreman, Enhanced production of *Scenedesmus* spp. (green microalgae) using a new medium containing fermented swine wastewater, Bioresour. Technol. 98 (2007) 2220–2228.
- [133] K.E. Dickinson, W.J. Bjornsson, L.L. Garrison, C.G. Whitney, K.C. Park, A.H. Banskota, P.J. McGinn, Simultaneous remediation of nutrients from liquid anaerobic digestate and municipal wastewater by the microalga *Scenedesmus* sp. AMDD grown in continuous chemostat, J. Appl. Microbiol. 118 (2014) 75–83.
- [134] R. Durvasula, I. Hurwitz, A. Fieck, D.V. Subba Rao, Culture, growth, pigments and lipid content of *Scenedesmus* species, an extremophile microalga from Soda Dam, New Mexico in wastewater, Algal Res. 10 (2015) 128–133.